

1 IGNACIA S. MORENO
2 Assistant Attorney General
3 Environment & Natural Resources Division

4 SETH M. BARSKY, Acting Chief
5 KRISTEN L. GUSTAFSON, Assistant Chief
6 CLIFFORD E. STEVENS, JR., Trial Attorney (D.C. Bar # 463906)
7 U.S. Department of Justice
8 Environment and Natural Resources Division
9 Wildlife and Marine Resources Section
10 P.O. Box 7369
11 Washington, DC 20044-7369
12 Telephone: (202) 353-7548
13 Facsimile: (202) 305-0275
14 clifford.stevens@usdoj.gov

15 **Counsel for Federal Defendants**

16 IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
17 FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

18 SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION

19 CENTER FOR BIOLOGICAL DIVERSITY,)
20 Plaintiff,)
21 vs.)
22 KEN SALAZAR, et al.,)
23 Defendants,)
24 and)
25 SAND CITY, CALIFORNIA and SAND)
CITY REDEVELOPMENT AGENCY,)
26 Intervenor,)
27 SECURITY NATIONAL GUARANTY, INC.,)
28 Intervenor,)
FRIENDS OF OCEANO DUNES, INC. and)
OXFOOT ASSOCIATES, LLC,)
Intervenor.)

Case No. 3:08-cv-4594-PJH

**JOINT STIPULATION AND
[PROPOSED] ORDER TO
AMEND SETTLEMENT
AGREEMENT AFFIRMED
BY THIS COURT ON MAY 1,
2009**

29 Plaintiff the Center for Biological Diversity ("Plaintiff") and Defendants Ken

1 Salazar,^{1/} Secretary of the United States Department of the Interior; Rowan Gould,^{2/} Acting
2 Director of the United States Fish and Wildlife Service; and the United States Fish and
Wildlife Service (“Service”) (collectively, “Federal Defendants”) declare as follows:

3 WHEREAS, this Court adopted a stipulated settlement agreement (“Agreement”)
4 between Plaintiff and Federal Defendants as an enforceable order of this Court on May 1,
2009, Dkt. No. 56;

5 WHEREAS, the Agreement currently states:

6 The Service will conduct a rulemaking to consider potential revisions to the
7 designated critical habitat for the Pacific Coast population of the western snowy
plover under Sections 4(b)(2) and 4(a)(3)(B) of the ESA, according to the following
schedule:

8 a. on or before December 1, 2010, the Service will submit to the Federal
9 Register for publication a proposed regulation setting forth any proposed
revisions to the critical habitat; and

10 b. on or before June 5, 2012, the Service will submit to the Federal Register
11 for publication a final determination on any proposed revisions to the critical
habitat.

12 Dkt. No. 55-2 at ¶ 1;

13 WHEREAS, the Agreement states that, “[t]he Parties may seek to modify the
14 deadlines specified in Paragraph 1 for good cause shown, consistent with the Federal Rules
of Civil Procedure,” Dkt. No. 55-2 at ¶ 2;

15 WHEREAS, because consideration of issues relating to the determination have proven
16 to be more complex than anticipated, FWS needs three additional months to issue the
proposed regulation setting forth any proposed revisions to the critical habitat;

17 WHEREAS, the parties to the Agreement have agreed that extending the deadline for
18 the proposed regulation is acceptable and appropriate;

19 NOW, THEREFORE, IT IS STIPULATED BY AND BETWEEN THE PARTIES
AS FOLLOWS:

20 Paragraph 1 of the Agreement shall be revised to read as follows:

21 The Service will conduct a rulemaking to consider potential revisions to the
22 designated critical habitat for the Pacific Coast population of the western snowy
plover under Sections 4(b)(2) and 4(a)(3)(B) of the ESA, according to the following
schedule:

24 a. on or before March 1, 2011, the Service will submit to the Federal Register

26 ^{1/} Pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 25(d), Ken Salazar is substituted as a defendant for Dirk
Kempthorne.

27 ^{2/} Pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 25(d), Rowan Gould is substituted as a defendant for H. Dale
28 Hall.

1 for publication a proposed regulation setting forth any proposed revisions to
2 the critical habitat; and

3 b. on or before June 5, 2012, the Service will submit to the Federal Register
4 for publication a final determination on any proposed revisions to the critical
5 habitat.

6 IT IS SO AGREED AND AFFIRMED,

7 Dated: 11/30/2010



8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

Honorable Phyllis J. Hamilton
Judge, United States District Court

1 Dated: November, 24 2010

2 Respectfully submitted,

3 IGNACIA S. MORENO
4 Assistant Attorney General
U.S. Department of Justice
5 Environment & Natural Resources Division

6 SETH M. BARSKY, Acting Section Chief
KRISTEN L. GUSTAFSON, Assistant Chief

7 Dated: November 24, 2010

8 By: /s/ Clifford E. Stevens, Jr.

9 CLIFFORD E. STEVENS, JR., Trial Attorney
Wildlife and Marine Resources Section
P.O. Box 7369
10 Washington, DC 20044-7369
Telephone: (202) 353-7548
Facsimile: (202) 305-0275
11 clifford.stevens@usdoj.gov

12 Counsel for Federal Defendants

13 Dated: November 24, 2010

14 By: /s/ John T. Buse

15 John T. Buse (CA Bar # 163156)
Center for Biological Diversity
5656 S. Dorchester #3
16 Chicago , IL 60637
Telephone: 323-533-4416
Facsimile: 610-885-2187
17 jbus@biologicaldiversity.org

18 Counsel for Plaintiff

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28